

before the mid-nineteenth century (as is evident in the *klirovye vedomosti*), it is precarious to assume that Innokentii's sermons had a broad impact. Indeed, the author examines only the discourse ("tropes"), not the reception—even in high circles, let alone the mass of unlettered Russian peasantry. Second, "Christianizing" here really pertains only to discourse; the reader learns little about parish life—about the miracles, conversions, apostasy, adultery, religious indifference, and parish-clergy conflict that fill the diocesan archive (including a collection in the State Archive of Odessa Oblast—the Odessa consistory, fond 173). Although the author has a coherent narrative, there is insufficient attention paid to priests and parishioners, who remain anonymous and inaccessible, despite the lengthy exegesis of sermons and references to "sacred landscapes." Finally, there are minor peccadilloes; Innokentii, for example, was previously appointed bishop in Vologda (not Vologod) and in 1841, not 1838 (p. 18).

Aside from such reservations, this study provides a valuable analysis of elite perception and writing about the Crimea on the part of the ranking clergy as well as state officials. It also helps to shed light on what the author calls "the pan-Orthodox sentiment and religious patriotism" that developed "throughout the empire and found expression in New Russia" (p. 67).

Brandeis University

GREGORY L. FREEZE

Dietrich Bonhoeffer Works, Vol. 12: Berlin: 1932-1933. English Edition, edited by Larry L. Rasmussen and translated by Isabel Best and David Higgins; supplementary material translated by Douglas W. Stott. (Minneapolis: Fortress Press. 2009. Pp. xxii, 680. \$55.00. ISBN 978-0-800-68312-2.)

Dietrich Bonhoeffer occupies a rare place in history. For example, he was one of the few Christians in Germany never charmed by any portion of what Hitler offered to the beleaguered German people. He, along with the rest of his family, recognized from the start what is acknowledged today—that this regime did not protect but violated moral values. He also occupies a rare place in history as a martyr, executed in April 1945 and now remembered, for example, at Westminster Abbey, where his statue is one of ten in a row of modern martyrs newly placed over the west entrance.

Bonhoeffer also occupies a relatively rare place in publishing, with sixteen thick volumes of his complete works offered to readers of English, thirteen of them now complete. This represents a project of the International Bonhoeffer Society, undertaken to make available in English the sixteen volumes completed in German by 1998. Bonhoeffer is well worth the trouble, on two counts. His life story is one of Christian courage and ethical acumen in response to Hitler and the Holocaust. Nazi horrors were perpetrated by a Christian nation with an extraordinary list of cultural accom-

pishments. Bonhoeffer's rare voice in opposition—including, finally, participation in the failed plot to assassinate Hitler—has an important place in the history of that period. Additionally, Bonhoeffer's writings increasingly became available and grew in stature during the postwar period, so that he now ranks among the most influential Protestant theologians of the twentieth century.

Volume 12 is of special interest, since it represents a crucial year, starting three months before the rise of Hitler. Born in 1906, Bonhoeffer was only in his mid-twenties at the time, but he had packed many accomplishments into his tender years. He completed his doctorate by age twenty-one and his second dissertation, the German *Habilitation*, at age twenty-four. He then spent 1930–31 at Union Theological Seminary in New York, befriending Reinhold Niebuhr and learning to know and respect the African American experience of worship at the Abyssinian Baptist Church in neighboring Harlem. Bonhoeffer began lecturing at the University of Berlin in 1931 at age twenty-five; this volume tells us much about his ideas, his students, and his unique approach to the trade of the German professor. He stood out for his students in his accessibility, the breadth of his knowledge, the sharpness of his theological insight, and the intensity of his political concerns. Larry Rasmussen, in his very useful introduction to this volume, argues that Bonhoeffer's lectures on Christology in summer 1933—available only through his students' notes—establish a foundation for both his theology and politics as they matured over the next twelve years.

During this period, Bonhoeffer also played a part in some of the most important decisions taken by the German Protestant Church, as can be seen in the letters and papers published in this volume. He helped the "Young Reformers" in their unsuccessful effort to thwart the pro-Nazi "German Christians" in the church elections of July 1933. He then worked with Martin Niemöller in developing the Pastor's Emergency League, a group opposed to "German Christian" attempts to impose the "Aryan Paragraph" in the church. Then he coauthored the Bethel Confession, which became a foundational document for Karl Barth's Barmen Declaration and the establishment of the Confessing Church. These writings and activities place Bonhoeffer at the heart of questions that remain important to our understanding of Protestants in Nazi Germany. Finally, this volume contains Bonhoeffer's "The Church and the Jewish Question," a document not without some controversy, but still a most prescient knife cutting through the anti-Jewish policies of the Nazi program. Published in June 1933, this document challenged the church to question the state "as to the legitimate state character of its actions" and to remember the church's "unconditional obligation toward the victims of any societal order, even if they do not belong to the Christian community." Then, if a formal church council found it necessary, the church was obliged "not just to bind up the wounds of the [Jewish] victims beneath the wheel but to seize the wheel itself" (p. 365), a foreshadowing of resistance that Bonhoeffer eventu-

ally undertook himself, with a small coterie of fellow conspirators but without benefit of a church body behind him.

Pacific Lutheran University
Tacoma, WA

ROBERT P. ERICKSEN

Confronting the Nazi War on Christianity. The Kulturkampf Newsletters, 1936-1939. Edited and translated by Richard Bonney. [Studies in the History of Religious and Political Pluralism, Vol. 4.] (Bern: Peter Lang, 2009. Pp. x, 578. \$86.95 paperback. ISBN 978-3-039-11904-2.)

Some of the most incisive and forceful descriptions and analyses of the Nazi campaign against the German churches and indeed against Christianity were contained in 135 *Kulturkampf* Newsletters written between January 1936 and the end of August 1939, which appeared at almost weekly intervals. Published first in Paris, they also appeared in a German edition, a British edition in 1937, and a U.S. edition in 1939. They have now been republished in an almost complete edition translated by Richard Bonney. As a contemporary source, these newsletters were extremely well informed and provided a valuable chronology of the Nazi persecution of the churches. They served as one of the first decided commentaries outlining the essential opposition and incompatibility between the Nazi Weltanschauung and Christian faith.

This repeated theme is supplemented by detailed documentation of the Nazis' overt harassment of dissident priests and pastors, the suppression of the churches' publications, and the closure of schools and organizations. In addition, extracts are given from the speeches and writings of prominent Nazis, outlining their deliberate hostility, which were all seen as part of a wider campaign not merely to control but eventually to eradicate Christianity from Germany. Fittingly, the final issue condemned the Nazi ideology, with its "divinization" of Hitler and its appeal to racial consciousness as the basis for a new state religion.

These newsletters also provide evidence of the attempts made by the churches to combat this ideological campaign. The sermons of Bishop Clement von Galen of Münster were quoted with approval, as was the Papal Encyclical of March 1937. Increasingly attention was paid in 1937 and 1938 to the campaign against the Protestant churches and to the valiant responses of the Confessing Church. In April 1938 a whole issue was devoted to the show trial of Pastor Martin Niemöller. His sentencing to a concentration camp, despite his legal acquittal, was seen as another example of Nazi plans for repression of all church opposition.

Further, another recurrent theme of these newsletters is the folly of those gullible churchmen who believed they could be good Catholics or Protestants and good Nazis at the same time. Here, these illusions were res-